## Before the Federal Communications Commission Washington, D.C. 20554

)

)

)

In the Matter of

Rural Digital Opportunity Fund

Connect America Fund

WC Docket No. 19-126

WC Docket No. 10-90

## **REPLY COMMENTS OF CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS, INC.**

Elizabeth Andrion Senior Vice President, Regulatory Affairs Christine Sanquist Vice President, Regulatory Affairs Charter Communications, Inc. 601 Massachusetts Avenue, NW Suite 400W Washington, DC 20001 Tel: (202) 621-1900 E-mail: Elizabeth.Andrion@charter.com

April 28, 2020

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION AND EXECUTIVE SUMMARY			
I.	The Record Underscores that Granting the Petition Is Necessary to Further the Commission's Goals of Universal Service as well as the Public Interest		3
II.	Concerns Regarding Charter's Petition Are Inapposite and Fail to Explain How Overbuilding Promotes the Commission's Goals		5
	A.	Exclusion from Phase I of the RDOF Auction Turns on Whether a Census Block Is "Wholly Unserved."	5
	В.	Charter's Limited Flexibility Is Immaterial to the Need for Waiver to Focus Phase I on Unserved Areas and Avoid Overbuilding	3
	C.	RDOF Is Not Meant to Foster Competition, and Charter's Petition Is Not Anti-Competitive	)
III.	Claims	that the Petition Is Procedurally Inappropriate are Meritless	)
CONCLUSION			

## Before the Federal Communications Commission Washington, D.C. 20554

In the Matter of Rural Digital Opportunity Fund Connect America Fund

WC Docket No. 19-126

WC Docket No. 10-90

## **REPLY COMMENTS OF CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS, INC.**

Charter Communications, Inc. hereby submits these reply comments in support of its Petition for Waiver of the Commission's rules governing the Rural Digital Opportunity Fund ("RDOF") auction to exclude from Phase I of the auction certain census blocks in which Charter already has plans to deploy qualifying service to satisfy commitments to the State of New York.<sup>1</sup>

## INTRODUCTION AND EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The record filed in response to Charter's Petition underscores the need to grant the waiver expeditiously so that the Commission can focus finite universal service resources on unserved areas and avoid overbuilding. Indeed, this is ultimately just an issue of timing; had the auction been scheduled later, the census blocks would have service, be excluded under the Commission's rules, and require no waiver. Commenters that raise concerns about the Petition fail to address the Commission's core public policy goals and instead take issue with its decision to exclude partiallyserved census blocks from Phase I of the RDOF, ignoring that such blocks may gain funding in Phase II. Similarly, concerns about Charter's limited flexibility under its New York commitments

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Charter Petition for Waiver, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 10, 2020) ("Petition").

ignore crucial facts, including that (a) Charter has nearly completed deployment to many of the census blocks at issue, and (b) Charter's allowance to make substitutions to the addresses it will serve to meet the commitment is constrained—although Charter is permitted to make some discretionary changes to that list (which are strictly capped in quantity), it does not anticipate doing so in a way that would cause it to no longer serve the specific census blocks that are the subject of the Petition.

Claims that granting Charter's Petition would harm competition are wrong, and irrelevant to analyzing whether these census blocks should be excluded from Phase I of the RDOF auction, because universal service fund support is not intended to subsidize competition:<sup>2</sup> Phase 1 excludes areas where "25/3 Mbps or better service has been or *will be* deployed without Rural Digital Opportunity Fund support" to preserve finite universal service funding for the areas that need it most, *i.e.*, wholly unserved census blocks.<sup>3</sup>

Finally, there is nothing procedurally improper about Charter's waiver request. Commenters cite no authority for their claims that Charter's Petition is premature or improperly substitutes for a petition for reconsideration. The Commission has broad authority to waive any provision of its rules "at any time" for "good cause." As Charter has shown—and as numerous commenters agree, such as the town supervisors of the towns of North Collins and Porter, business development organizations like the Business Council of New York State, Inc. and the Buffalo

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See, e.g., In re Connect America Fund, Second Order on Reconsideration, 33 FCC Rcd 2540, 2556 ¶ 25 n.128 (2018) ("The Commission has repeatedly held that universal service funding is meant to subsidize the expansion and preservation of coverage, not marketplace competition or certain competitors.") ("CAF Order III"); In re Connect America Fund, Order on Reconsideration and Second Report and Order, 32 FCC Rcd 6282, 6292 ¶ 18 (2017) ("Our objective in [Mobility Fund]-II, in accordance with the USF/ICC Transformation Order, is to subsidize reasonably comparable service in unserved areas, not to subsidize competition.") ("CAF Order II").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In re Rural Digital Opportunity Fund Connect America Fund, Report and Order, 35 FCC Rcd 686, 692 ¶ 13 & n.32 (2020) ("RDOF Order") (emphasis added).

Niagara Partnership, and community organizations like the YWCA of Syracuse and Onondaga County and the Boys & Girls Clubs of Schenectady<sup>4</sup>—good cause exists to exclude the census blocks at issue here to further the RDOF's goals of closing the digital divide and connecting unserved areas with broadband.

## I. The Record Underscores that Granting the Petition Is Necessary to Further the Commission's Goals of Universal Service as well as the Public Interest.

In adopting Phase I of the RDOF auction, the Commission aimed to "maximize the impact of finite universal service resources," by "targeting support to prioritized areas," *i.e.*, areas that are "wholly unserved."<sup>5</sup> As NCTA highlights, this policy is longstanding; the Commission's Connect America Fund Order ("*CAF Order*") explicitly relied on the same rationale, "target[ing] support [in] areas not served by an unsubsidized competitor."<sup>6</sup> Granting Charter's Petition, as NCTA explains, would align with the Commission's policy of directing finite universal service support

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See, e.g., Letter from John Tobia, Town Supervisor, Town of North Collins, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1 (Apr. 27, 2020) ("RDOF should focus on regions outside of Charter's build - maximizing internet accessibility to New Yorkers in need.") ("North Collins Comments"); Letter from John Johnston, Supervisor, Town of Porter, to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1 (Apr. 27, 2020) ("I would like to offer my support for Charter's Petition for Waiver to ensure federal broadband subsidies are not used to build on top of Charter's network.") ("Town of Porter Comments"); Letter from Heather Briccetti, Business Council of New York State, Inc., to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1 (Apr. 27, 2020) ("RDOF's scarce resources should remain available to other areas of New York where federal subsidies are necessary to ensure broadband buildout - not to duplicate efforts in areas already being privately funded.") ("NYS Business Council Comments"); Letter from Dottie Gallagher, President and CEO, Buffalo Niagara Partnership, to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1 (Apr. 27, 2020) ("If Charter's blocks are not excluded, these areas could be overbuilt, which would be an ineffective use of hard-earned taxpayer dollars.") ("Buffalo Niagara Partnership Comments"); Letter from Fanny Villarreal, Executive Director/CEO, YWCA of Syracuse and Onondaga County, to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1-2 (Apr. 27, 2020) ("[W]e cannot risk overbuilding some areas while others go unserved."); Letter from Shane Bargy, Executive Director, Boys & Girls Clubs of Schenectady, to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1-2 (Apr. 27, 2020) ("Charter's \$600 million investment of its own capital to build out rural areas in our region means that federal subsidies can be reserved for areas that are truly unserved.").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> *RDOF Order*, 35 FCC Rcd at 693-95 ¶¶ 15, 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Comments of NCTA – The Internet and Television Association, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 2 (Apr. 21, 2020) ("*NCTA Comments*") (citing *In re Connect America Fund*, Report and Order and Further Notice of Proposed Rulemaking, 26 FCC Rcd 17,663, 17,729 ¶ 170 (2011)).

toward areas where service would not be deployed otherwise.<sup>7</sup> NCTA rightly notes that the Commission has also reemphasized this priority very recently, proposing that its 5G Fund target "rural areas of our country that would be unlikely to see timely deployment of voice and 5G broadband service absent high-cost support and or as part of T-Mobile's transaction-related commitments."<sup>8</sup> The Commission's 5G Fund for Rural America Notice of Proposed Rulemaking underscores the concern, "not[ing] that failing to adequately account for T-Mobile's enforceable 5G deployment commitments would risk using our limited universal service support to overbuild areas that would see timely, unsubsidized 5G deployment by T-Mobile."<sup>9</sup>

Here, the census blocks that are the subject of the Petition are ones in which "25/3 Mbps or better service . . . will be deployed without Rural Digital Opportunity Fund support"<sup>10</sup> pursuant to Charter's New York broadband deployment commitments.<sup>11</sup> As the town supervisors for the towns of North Collins and Porter note, disbursing RDOF funds to such areas diverts scarce

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> *NCTA Comments* at 2-3; *see also* Letter from John Brezinski, Minority Leader, Herkhimer County Legislature, to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 27, 2020); Letter from Mark Eagan, President & CEO, Capital Region Chamber of Commerce, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 27, 2020); Letter from Debora Brown-Johnson, President, NAACP Albany Branch, to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 27, 2020); Letter from Decarto Draper, Head Pastor, Tucker Missionary Baptist Church, to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 28, 2020); Letter from Chery Brannan, Founder & CEO, Sister to Sister International, Inc., to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1 (Apr. 26, 2020); Letter from Shari McDonough, Boys & Girls Clubs of Buffalo, to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 24, 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> NCTA Comments at 5 n.14 (quoting Establishing a 5G Fund for Rural America, GN Docket No. 20-32, Notice of Proposed Rulemaking and Order, FCC-CIRC2004-02 (Apr. 2, 2020)).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> In re Establishing a 5G Fund for Rural America, Notice of Proposed Rulemaking and Order, GN Docket No. 20-32, FCC 20-52 ¶ 130 n.196 (rel. Apr. 24, 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> *RDOF Order*, 35 FCC Rcd at 692 ¶ 13 n.32; *see also NCTA Comments* at 3. Starry, Inc.'s curious (and uncited) assertion that the Commission is not explicitly concerned with overbuilding in the future is therefore expressly contradicted by the *RDOF Order*. Comments of Starry, Inc., WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 4 (Apr. 21, 2020) ("*Starry, Inc. Comments*") ("the Commission is not concerned with subsidizing networks that may be overbuilt *in the future*." (emphasis in original)).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See Petition, Exhibits A-C.

resources from "wholly unserved" census blocks<sup>12</sup>—precisely the areas Phase I is meant to help. The Supervisor for the Town of Porter, which has "been on both sides of the digital divide," urges the Commission to ensure that RDOF funds are "not used to build on top of Charter's network" in order to preserve RDOF subsidies "for the far too many areas of New York that otherwise have no hope of access to reliable high speed broadband."<sup>13</sup> Organizations like the Business Council of New York State, Inc. and the Buffalo Niagara Partnership note that "RDOF's scarce resources" should be directed "where federal subsidies are necessary to ensure broadband buildout – not to duplicate efforts in areas already being privately funded,"<sup>14</sup> and that "[r]emoving these areas from [RDOF] eligibility means more federal funding is available per census block for the 8,609 RDOFeligible blocks in New York that remain."<sup>15</sup>

As NCTA correctly observes, the only factual difference between Charter's circumstances and those contemplated as justifying Phase I exclusion in the *RDOF Order—i.e.*, that Charter's commitment is self-funded and the others are not—in no way justifies different conclusions regarding eligibility.<sup>16</sup> As explained in the Petition, these circumstances constitute "good cause" to grant the requested waiver and exclude the census blocks at issue.<sup>17</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See North Collins Comments at 1; Town of Porter Comments at 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> *Town of Porter Comments* at 1; *see also* Letter from Charles Reaves, Executive Director, Literacy Rochester, to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 26, 2020); Letter from Ashanti H. Dickerson, Pastor, New Hope Baptist Church Syracuse, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 28, 2020); Letter from Shawn Roberson, Pastor, Southern Missionary Baptist Church, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 27, 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> NYS Business Council Comments at 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> *Buffalo Niagara Partnership Comments* at 1; *see also* Letter from Timothy Brown, Pastor, Mount Zion Missionary Baptist Church, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 27, 2020); Letter from Kinzer Pointer, Agape Fellowship Baptist Church, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 27, 2020); Letter from H. Bernard Alex, Pastor, Victory Temple Baptist Church, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 27, 2020); Letter from H. Bernard Alex, Pastor, Victory Temple Baptist Church, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 (Apr. 27, 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> See NCTA Comments at 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> See Petition at 2-5. Otsego Electric notes that two of the waiver decisions cited in Charter's Petition granted waiver because not doing so would have caused hardship in high-cost areas, or deprived those areas of telecommunications

II. Concerns Regarding Charter's Petition Are Inapposite and Fail to Explain How Overbuilding Promotes the Commission's Goals.

Some commenters raise concerns regarding the scope of Charter's commitment in New York, ranging from the specific number of addresses that will be served in a particular census block to the specific parameters of the New York settlement.<sup>18</sup> Not only are these concerns unfounded, they essentially attack the Commission's standard for determining eligible areas for Phase I of the RDOF auction.

## A. Exclusion from Phase I of the RDOF Auction Turns on Whether a Census Block Is "Wholly Unserved."

Under the Commission's rules, census blocks where a provider serves a single household are ineligible for Phase I of the RDOF auction. The Commission made this choice explicit, stating that "we decline to expand the list of eligible areas at this time and instead focus Phase I on the known *wholly unserved* census blocks,"<sup>19</sup> and noting that "Phase II will target unserved locations within areas that data demonstrates are only partially served."<sup>20</sup> It acknowledged that "[t]he FCC Form 477 data have been criticized for identifying partially served blocks as 'served," but noted

and information services. Joint Comments of Otsego Electric Cooperative, Inc. and OEConnect, LLC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 5 (Apr. 21, 2020) ("*Otsego Comments*"). According to Otsego Electric, Charter's Petition presents a scenario where *granting* waiver would deny rural areas service. This criticism misses the mark. Charter is undisputedly subject to deployment commitments in these areas, and has taken material steps to fulfill these commitments already. Given these facts, allocating RDOF support to such areas would represent a suboptimal use of limited resources; as the *RDOF Order* itself states, this funding is better spent on "wholly unserved" areas. Otsego Electric does not and indeed cannot explain why the areas at issue in the Petition represent better uses of scarce public funds than those in which no provider at all is committed to deploy service.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> See, e.g., Letter from David Wolff, Broadband Committee Chairman, AdkAction, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1-2 (Apr. 21, 2020) ("AdkAction Comments"); Letter from Robin J. Hill, Executive Director, Central Adirondack Partnership for the 21st Century, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1-2 (Apr. 21, 2020) ("Central Adirondack Partnership Comments"); Letter from Beth Schiller, Owner, Cv Wireless LLC, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1-2 (Apr. 2020) ("Cv Wireless Comments"); Letter from David Berkstresser, Supervisor, Town of Webb, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1-2 (Apr. 21, 2020) ("Town of Webb Comments"); see also Otsego Comments at 3-4; Starry, Inc. comments at 4-5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> *RDOF Order*, 35 FCC Rcd at 692 ¶ 13 (emphasis added).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> *Id.* at 688 ¶ 5.

that "[t]he primary shortcomings of FCC Form 477 data do not come into play under the twophased framework we adopt here" because census blocks that are partially served can be addressed and identified in the *second* phase.<sup>21</sup> The Commission therefore excluded areas identified as "served" in the Form 477 data from the first phase with the understanding that the effect of this decision would be to defer areas that are served only partially to Phase II.

Consequently, commenters who raise concerns that granting the waiver would lead to excluding census blocks that Charter may only partially serve through its New York commitments, or that Charter may not connect every household in the census blocks at issue, are attacking the Commission's decision to fund wholly unserved census blocks in Phase I and partially unserved census blocks in Phase II.<sup>22</sup> The Commission should decline these comments' implicit invitation to apply a different and higher standard to Charter's request to exclude these census blocks from Phase I than the *RDOF Order* itself does. The impact of their contention is in any event limited by the fact that approximately 25% of the 2,127 census blocks for which waiver is sought should be excluded from Phase I regardless of how the Commission resolves the Petition, as they have already received New York State broadband awards.<sup>23</sup> The presence of independent grounds to exclude these areas further narrows the scope and impact of any waiver granted here.

Tellingly, the New York State Public Service Commission ("NYSPSC")—which imposed the state deployment obligations under discussion in order to expand service to the rural and unserved areas at issue in this proceeding—does not oppose the Petition, asking instead "that the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> *RDOF Order*, 35 FCC Rcd at 690-91 ¶¶ 10-11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> See AdkAction Comments at 1-2; Central Adirondack Partnership Comments at 1-2; Cv Wireless Comments at 1-2; Town of Webb Comments at 1-2; see generally NYSPSC Comments at 1 (requesting consideration of the fact that Charter's commitment "does not guarantee that every address within a census block will get passed").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> See Exhibit A (identifying the census blocks awarded a New York State broadband award).

FCC ensure that New York State is not harmed and declare that if Charter's petition, or other similar requests, is granted for Phase I, New York will remain eligible for *future* phases of RDOF auctions."<sup>24</sup> The NYSPSC argues only that exclusion would be inappropriate at Phase II or later, an argument Charter itself agrees with, as the blocks at issue will be partially served in the future and therefore potentially eligible for Phase II.<sup>25</sup>

Some commenters urge the Commission to condition any waiver on subjecting Charter to RDOF milestones and noncompliance penalties for the excluded blocks, or to require Charter to serve all census blocks in its region.<sup>26</sup> These commenters are essentially asking the Commission to treat Charter as a winning bidder in the RDOF auction and add federal milestones to a state commitment. There is no basis for doing so—no Form 477 filer has this heightened burden.

## B. Charter's Limited Flexibility Is Immaterial to the Need for Waiver to Focus Phase I on Unserved Areas and Avoid Overbuilding.

Some commenters note that Charter possesses, consistent with its New York commitments, "a small degree of flexibility in making substitutions to the list of specific addresses required to be served," and suggest that Charter therefore might ultimately satisfy those commitments through construction in census blocks other than those that are the subject of the Petition.<sup>27</sup> Though Charter has some limited ability to make changes to the specific addresses it will use to meet its settlement

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Letter from Robert Rosenthal, General Counsel, New York State Public Service Commission, to Marlene H. Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 2 (Apr. 21, 2020) ("*NYSPSC Comments*") (requesting that "New York remain eligible for receipt of any additional funds awarded through *subsequent phases* of the RDOF auctions" (emphasis added)).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> *Id.* at 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> See Central Adirondack Partnership Comments at 2; Cv Wireless Comments at 1; Town of Webb Comments at 1; Letter from Andrea M. Dumas, Mayor, Village of Malone, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 2 (Apr. 21, 2020); Letter from James T. Townsend, Senior Advisor, Adirondack Landowners' Association, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 2 (Apr. 21, 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> See, e.g., NYSPSC Comments at 2; see also Otsego Comments at 3.

obligations, commenters significantly overstate the relevance of that flexibility to the Petition.<sup>28</sup> As Charter has demonstrated, it has already made significant progress in deploying service to the areas at issue, and deployment will be complete to a substantial number of those census blocks before the auction begins in October.<sup>29</sup> Charter's ability to make discretionary "swaps" to the list of addresses submitted to the NYSPSC is also, as the NYSPSC comments note, subject to a strict numerical cap,<sup>30</sup> and some of those discretionary swaps have already been "used" and are reflected in the list of census blocks that are the subject of the Petition. More importantly, however, Charter has no current plans or intentions to use its theoretical ability to make modest future changes to the address list in a manner that would cause it to no longer extend service to the census blocks at issue. Charter has expended significant resources in these census blocks already, including developing time-intensive network deployment plans that it is now in the process of implementing. Finally, though Charter's settlement agreement permits some circumstances in which Charter can substitute addresses without counting towards its numerical cap, those circumstances would either not affect service to the census block or would generally arise only where the original census block is ineligible for RDOF support in any event.<sup>31</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Several commenters allege that Charter's New York commitments should be discounted by the Commission because of what one commenter terms a "history of delay" with the deadlines associated with New York Public Service Commission orders preceding the current settlement agreement. *See, e.g.*, Comments of the Wireless Internet Service Providers Association, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 7-8 (Apr. 21, 2020) ("*WISPA Comments*"); Letter from Didi Barrett, Assembly Member of New York, 106th District, to Marlene H. Dortch, Secretary, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1 (Apr. 20, 2020) ("*Barrett Comments*"); *see also Starry, Inc. Comments* at 2. The settlement agreement limits Charter's ability to comment publicly on the disputes that preceded it, but Charter notes that the settlement resolved those previous disputes without any finding of liability or violation on Charter's part, and that Charter has been reporting progress under the settlement far in excess of the agreed upon buildout schedule.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> See Petition, Exhibit A (tracking census blocks by walkout status, design status, submission of project pole permits, and receipt of pole licenses).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> See NYSPSC Comments at 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> The agreement does not count substitutions made due to (a) technical corrections to the address format; (b) addresses that replace those originally in designated *urban* areas; (c) addresses that are mistaken, duplicative, or non-verifiable; (d) addresses removed because the New York State Department of Public Service determines that they are not eligible under the terms of Charter's commitment (*e.g.*, because it concludes that Charter's existing facilities are sufficiently

## C. RDOF Is Not Meant to Foster Competition, and Charter's Petition Is Not Anti-Competitive.

Though several commenters claim that granting the Petition would harm competition,<sup>32</sup> that assertion is both incorrect and irrelevant to the Petition.<sup>33</sup> The purpose of the universal service fund is not to subsidize competition, but to support the deployment of service where there is none.<sup>34</sup> Accordingly, with respect to RDOF, the Commission has determined that scarce universal service support is better spent on the large number of rural areas that lack 25/3 Mbps broadband service, rather than on increasing the number of providers in areas where service is already available.<sup>35</sup>

## **III.** Claims that the Petition Is Procedurally Inappropriate are Meritless.

WISPA's claims that Charter's Petition is premature and that Charter is somehow prohibited from seeking a waiver because it did not file a petition for reconsideration in the *RDOF* proceeding are meritless.<sup>36</sup> WISPA contends that Charter's Petition is premature because the Wireline Competition Bureau has not yet issued a public notice containing the final list of census

proximate to the address to serve it without new network expansion, service from another provider is already available there, or it overlaps an existing wireline state broadband grant); or (e) where Charter determines another provider is already present. *See id.*, Sections 5(a)-5(e).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> See, e.g., Starry, Inc. Comments at 4-5 (arguing that granting the Petition "would set a strong precedent for other providers to make attempts to corner markets"); Otsego Comments at 4; WISPA Comments at 5-6, 9 ("[G]ranting the Petition would open the door for any party to leverage a merger commitment into foreclosure of competition."); Barrett Comments at 1; see also Letter from Frank Thomas, Chairman, Warren County Board of Supervisors, to Ajit Pai, Chairman, FCC, WC Docket Nos. 19-126, 10-90 at 1 (Apr. 21, 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> WISPA's assertion that Charter cannot apply for RDOF funding for these blocks because of a provision in Charter's FCC merger order, and is therefore trying to block funding for other providers, is likewise incorrect and inapposite. *WISPA Comments* at 6-7. The FCC merger conditions to which it refers prohibit Charter from using universal service funding to satisfy the Commission's *federal* deployment obligations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> See, e.g., CAF Order III, 33 FCC Rcd at 2556 ¶ 25 n.128 ("The Commission has repeatedly held that universal service funding is meant to subsidize the expansion and preservation of coverage, not marketplace competition or certain competitors."); CAF Order II, 32 FCC Rcd at 6292 ¶ 18 ("Our objective in [Mobility Fund]-II, in accordance with the USF/ICC Transformation Order, is to subsidize reasonably comparable service in unserved areas, not to subsidize competition.").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> In any event, concerns about competition are misguided. Providers who wish to deploy service in the census blocks at issue will be able to compete with Charter on what will be, at the very least, an even playing field; Charter will receive no support via Phase I to serve such areas, and neither will they.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> WISPA Comments at 3-5.

blocks eligible for RDOF support.<sup>37</sup> But WISPA identifies no requirement to wait until census blocks have been conclusively identified as eligible for RDOF support before seeking a waiver of Section 54.802(a)—the rule that allows the census blocks identified in the Petition to be identified as eligible for RDOF support. Indeed, the Commission has broad authority to waive *any* provision of its rules—including Section 54.802(a)—"in whole or in part, at any time" for good cause.<sup>38</sup>

And WISPA's preferred timing would needlessly delay the auction process. In its Order, the Commission opted for a limited window to challenge the Bureau's preliminary list of eligible census blocks in order to avoid the burdens and delays that would come with a more drawn-out process.<sup>39</sup> If Charter waited to submit its Petition until the list of eligible areas is finalized and the Phase I auction process is underway, the Commission could not consider how to address the more than 2,000 census blocks at issue here without delaying or otherwise disrupting that process. There is nothing in the Commission's rules that compels it do so.

WISPA's other procedural claim—that Charter's failure to file a petition for reconsideration somehow prohibits Charter from seeking a waiver—fares no better.<sup>40</sup> WISPA cites no authority at all for this objection (unsurprisingly, because Rule 1.3 contains no such requirement), and it makes little sense. Indeed, Rule 1.3 provides that the Commission may waive any provision of its rules "at any time," and even on its own motion.<sup>41</sup> The touchstone for granting waivers is good cause, not exhaustion of other remedies. Charter has shown that good cause exists

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> *Id.* at 3.

 $<sup>^{38}</sup>$  47 C.F.R. § 1.3 ("The provisions of this chapter [*i.e.*, Chapter 1 of Title 47 of the Code of Federal Regulations] may be suspended, revoked, amended, or waived for good cause shown, in whole or in part, at any time by the Commission .... Any provision of the rules may be waived by the Commission on its own motion or on petition if good cause therefor is shown.").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> *RDOF Order*, 35 FCC Rcd at 692-94 ¶¶ 14-15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> WISPA Comments at 3-5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> 47 C.F.R. § 1.3.

to exclude the census blocks at issue here. Doing so will ensure that limited universal service support is not used to overbuild in areas of New York that are already slated to receive broadband coverage in the near future.

## CONCLUSION

For the foregoing reasons, there is good cause to waive Section 54.802(a) of the Commission's rules as necessary to exclude from Phase I of the RDOF auction those census blocks in which Charter has a binding New York State obligation to deploy broadband services. Doing so will further the Commission's goals as well as serve the public interest.

Dated: April 28, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

<u>/s/ Elizabeth Andrion</u> Elizabeth Andrion Senior Vice President, Regulatory Affairs Christine Sanquist Vice President, Regulatory Affairs Charter Communications, Inc. 601 Massachusetts Avenue, NW Suite 400W Washington, DC 20001 Tel: (202) 621-1900 E-mail: Elizabeth.Andrion@charter.com

# **EXHIBIT** A

#### Awardee

Armstrong Telecommunications Armstrong Telecommunications **Armstrong Telecommunications** Armstrong Telecommunications **Armstrong Telecommunications** Armstrong Telecommunications **Clarity Fiber Solutions Clarity Fiber Solutions Clarity Fiber Solutions Frontier Communications Frontier Communications** Haefele TV Inc. Hughes Network Systems, LLC Hughes Network Systems, LLC

## Awardee

360130374003124
360130375003021
360130375003034
360130375003080
360150110001017
360150110001052
360150110003001
360150110003035
360150110003047
360150110003064
360150110003070
360359705005028
360379502001015
360379513001007
360379513001015
360379513001032
360379513004036
360430101002005
360430101005026
360430101005033
360499502003044
360499502003050
360499502003051
360499502003055
360510311004061
360530305022051
360530305022088
360530308002029
360530308002033
360530308002063
360530308002131
360530308002133
360530310001015
360530310001021
360530310001023
360530310001088
360530310002000
360530310002006
360530310002007
360530310002008
360530310002009
360530310002068
360530310002071
360530310002072

#### Awardee

360530310002075
360530310002078
360530310002079
360530310002084
360530310003047
360530310003054
360530310003059
360530310003060
360530310003062
360530310003088
360979503001004
361019602002020
361019602003084
361019602003108
361019602003113
361019602003114
361019602003138
361019603001011
361019603001014
361019603001019
361019603001021
361019603001025
361019603001039
361019603001099
361019603001101
361019603001110
361019603001111
361019603002010
361019604001002
361019604001006
361019604001008
361019604004081
361019604004092
361019605001039
361019605001057
361019605001058
361019605001070
361019605001072
361019605001091
361019605001105
361019605001124
361019605002000
361019605003003
361019605003004

#### Awardee

361019611001028
361019611004057
361019611004069
361019611004071
361019611004080
361019611004085
361019613003028
361019613003030
361019613003031
361059501001069
361059519001028
361059523001017
361090018001072
361170209001020
361170209001021
361170210001022
361170210002014
361170215011070
361170215021005
361170215021009
361170215021033
361170215021036
361170215021037
361170215021053
361170216001009
361170216001014
361170216001033
361170216001036
361170216001041
361170216001048
361170216002011
361170216002021
361170216002079
361170216002081
361170216003003
361170217001008
361219704003020
361219704003040
361219704003041
361219704003042
361219708003005
361219708003008
361219708003015
361219711002069

361231501001094   361231501001167   361231501004130   361231501005021   361231501005023   361231501005023   361231505001017   361231505001029   360099604004037   360099605001024   360099605002009   360099605002009   360191018002112   360191018002112   360379511001038   360379511001070   360379511001070   360379511001070   360379511001070   360379511001072   360419504002027   360419504002027   360510308004017   360510308004017   360510308004017   360510308004028   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034
361231501001167   361231501005021   361231501005023   361231505001017   361231505001029   360099604004037   360099605001024   360099605002009   360099605002009   360191018002112   360191018002114   360379511001069   360379511001070   360379511001072   360419504002027   360419504002027   360419504002027   360510308004011   360510308004017   360510308004017   360510308004028   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034   360510308004034
361231501004130 361231501005021 361231505001017 361231505001029 360099604004037 360099604004037 360099605001024 360099605002008 360099605002009 360191018002112 360191018002112 360191018002114 360191018002115 360379511001038 360379511001070 360379511001070 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004017 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034
361231501005021 361231505001017 361231505001029 360099604004037 360099604004043 360099605001024 360099605002008 360099605002009 360099605002019 360191018002112 360191018002112 360191018002114 360379503002003 360379511001070 360379511001070 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004017 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034
361231501005023 361231505001017 361231505001029 360099604004037 360099605001024 360099605002008 360099605002009 360099605002009 360191018002112 360191018002114 360191018002114 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004017 360510308004028 360510308004027 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034
361231505001017 361231505001029 360099604004037 360099605001024 360099605002008 360099605002009 360099605002019 360191018002112 360191018002112 360191018002114 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004027 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034
361231505001029 360099604004037 360099605001024 360099605002008 360099605002009 360099605002019 360191018002000 360191018002112 360191018002114 360191018002115 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001070 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004011 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004028 360510308004027 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034
360099604004037 360099605001024 360099605002009 360099605002009 360199605002019 360191018002019 360191018002112 360191018002114 360191018002115 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034
360099604004043 360099605001024 360099605002009 360099605002009 360191018002060 360191018002112 360191018002112 360191018002114 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004027 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054
360099605001024 360099605002008 360099605002009 360099605002019 360191018002112 360191018002112 360191018002114 360191018002115 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001070 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004011 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 3605103080040351 360510308004054
360099605002008 360099605002009 360199605002019 360191018002112 360191018002112 360191018002114 360191018002115 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004028 360510308004027 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034
360099605002009 360099605002019 360191018002112 360191018002112 360191018002114 360191018002115 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004028 360510308004027 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004035 360510308004051 360510308004054
360099605002019 360191018002060 360191018002112 360191018002114 360191018002114 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001069 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004017 360510308004017 360510308004028 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 3605103080040351 360510308004051
360191018002060 360191018002112 360191018002114 360191018002115 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001069 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004028 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004051 360510308004054
360191018002112 360191018002114 360191018002115 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001069 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004028 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054
360191018002114 360191018002115 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001069 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004054
360191018002115 360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001069 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004054
360379503002003 360379511001038 360379511001069 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054
360379511001038 360379511001069 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360379511001069 360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004054
360379511001070 360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004034 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360379511001072 360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004030 360510308004034 360510308004038 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360419504002027 360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004030 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360499504001034 360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004030 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004010 360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004030 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004011 360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004030 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004038 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004017 360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004030 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004038 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004027 360510308004028 360510308004030 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004038 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004028 360510308004030 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004038 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004030 360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004038 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004032 360510308004034 360510308004038 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004034 360510308004038 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004038 360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004039 360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004051 360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004054 360510308004056
360510308004056
360510308004061
360510308005001
360510308005004
360510308005005
360510308005007 360510308005008

94	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
58	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
57	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
80	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
21	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
23	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
7	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
29	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
37	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
13	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
24	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)8	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)9	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
19	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
50	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
2	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
4	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
15	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)3	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
88	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
59	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
70	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
2	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
_ 27	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
34	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
10	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
1	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
17	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
27	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
28	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
80	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
32	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
34	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
88	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
39	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
51	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
54	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
56	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
51	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)1	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)4	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)5	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)7	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)8	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
	Tugiles Network Systems, LLC

#### Awardee

360510308005014 360510308005019 360510308005025 360510308005029 360510308005032 360510308005044 360510308005045 360510308005052
360510308005025 360510308005029 360510308005032 360510308005044 360510308005045 360510308005052
360510308005029 360510308005032 360510308005044 360510308005045 360510308005052
360510308005032 360510308005044 360510308005045 360510308005052
360510308005044 360510308005045 360510308005052
360510308005045 360510308005052
360510308005052
260510202005057
360510308005057
360510308005066
360510308005079
360510308005082
360510308005083
360510308005087
360510308005095
360510308005096
360510308005102
360510308005106
360510308005110
360510308005112
360510312001015
360510312001022
360510312001028
360510312001032
360510312002000
360510312002005
360510312003000
360510313002038
360510313002039
360510313002040
360530307001092
360530307002036
360530307002130
360530307002134
360530307002137
360530307003034
360530307003150
360530307003162
360530308001012
360530308001012
360530308002008
360530308002008 360539406001005

## Awardee

360539406002070
360539406004107
360550147005052
360650239021069
360650241021042
360650241023019
360650241023020
360650241023034
360650241023037
360650241023039
360650241023041
360650241023065
360650241023066
360650241023067
360650245001010
360650245001018
360650245001045
360650245001084
360650250031054
360650255003038
360650255003039
360650255003055
360650255003057
360650255003058
360650255003060
360650255003061
360650255003062
360650256001006
360650256001018
360650256001024
360650256001025
360650256001026
360650256001037
360650256001040
360650256001045
360650256001048
360650256001049
360650256001051
360650256001052
360650256001053
360650256001054
360650256001055
360650256001060
360650256001063

#### Awardee

360650256001064
360650256001099
360650257001015
360650257001017
360650257001021
360650257001024
360650257001026
360650258001025
360650258001044
360690521003042
360690521003046
360690521003103
360690521003111
360690522001003
360690522001007
360690522001020
360690522001021
360690522001025
360690522001041
360690522003018
360690522003050
360690522003073
360690522003079
360775901002007
360999503004028
360999503004039
360999507001044
360999507004013
361219701001005
361219701001006
361219701001008
361219701001009
361219701001010
361219701001012
361219701001015
361219701001017
361219701001018
361219701001020
361219701001021
361219701001022
361219701001023
361219701001026
361219701001037
361219701001048

361219701001051	ŀ
361219701001074	ŀ
361219701001079	ŀ
361219701001080	ŀ
361219701001083	ŀ
361219702001041	ŀ
361219702001046	ŀ
361219702001048	ŀ
361219702001052	ŀ
361219702001053	ŀ
361219702001059	ŀ
361219704001003	ŀ
361219704001004	ŀ
361219704001007	ŀ
361219704001039	ŀ
361231502002018	ŀ
361231502002064	ŀ
361231502002068	ŀ
361231503004077	ŀ
360039501003126	ŀ
360379513001014	ŀ
360379513001016	ŀ
360430105021068	ŀ
360430105022043	ŀ
360430105022044	ŀ
360430105022047	ł
360430105022048	ł
360430109002058	ŀ
360430109002083	ŀ
360430109002137	ŀ
360510301001061	ŀ
360510301003039	ŀ
360510302011015	ŀ
360510302011025	ŀ
360510302011039	ŀ
360510302011043	ŀ
360510302012001	ŀ
360510302012004	ŀ
360510302012005	ŀ
360510302012012	ŀ
360510302012018	ŀ
360510302012023	ŀ
360510302012024	ŀ
360510302023003	ŀ

51	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
74	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
79	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
30	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
33	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
41	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
16	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
18	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
52	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
53	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
59	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)3	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)4	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)7	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
39	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
18	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
54	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
58	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
77	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
26	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
14	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
16	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
58	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
43	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
13	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
17	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
48	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
58	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
33	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
37	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
51	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
39	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
15	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
25	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
39	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
43	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
,, )1	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)4	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
)5	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
12	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
12	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
23	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
23 24	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
24 )3	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
	Hughes Network Systems, LLC

360530311001025
360530311001043
360530311001057
360530311001061
360530311001063
360530311001065
360530311002025
360530311002026
360530311002028
360530311002038
360530311002055
360530311002064
360530311002070
360550147005047
360659401001005
360659401001073
360659401004078
360659401004083
360659401004088
360659401004090
360659401004113
360730406002027
360734012003036
361059503001123
361059503001124
361059520001049
361059522001031
361059522001034
361059522001037
361059522001038
361059522001063
361059522001066
361059522001078
361059522001079
361059522001080
361059522001081
361059522001088
361059523001004
361059523001007
361059523001008
361059523001018
361059523001021
361059523001023
361059523001025

5	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
.3	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
7	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
1	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
3	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
5	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
5	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
6	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
8	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
8	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
5	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
4	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
0	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
.7	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
5	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
3	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
8	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
3	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
8	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
0	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
.3	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
7	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
6	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
3	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
4	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
.9	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
1	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
4	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
7	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
8	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
3	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
6	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
8	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
'9	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
0	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
1	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
8	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
4	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
7	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
8	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
.8	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
1	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
3	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
5	Hughes Network Systems, LLC

361059523001027	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361059523001028	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361059523001036	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361059523001111	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361059523001112	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361059523001117	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361059523001202	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361059525002100	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361059525002104	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361059525002106	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361059525002115	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361130710002064	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361130710002069	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361150820015014	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361150820015026	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361150820015028	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361150820015029	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361150820015037	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361150820015048	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361219701002079	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361219705001000	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361219705001001	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361219706006008	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361219706006010	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361219706006011	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361219706006025	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361219706006039	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361219706006041	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361219706006042	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361219706006048	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231501002069	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231501004011	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503001112	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503001127	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503001128	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503002003	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503002039	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503002040	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503002042	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503002043	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503002049	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503002051	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503002053	Hughes Network Systems, LLC
361231503002062	Hughes Network Systems, LLC

### Awardee

361231503003107
361231505001002
361231505002091
361231505002093
361231505002102
361231505003052
360039505004005
360039505004081
360039505004097
360039512001021
360039512001026
360039512002000
360039512004017
361219704003019
361219707002006
361219707002017
361219708001000
361219708001001
361219708001002
361231501002047
360499501001027
360499501001039
360499501001040
360499501001041
360499501001042
360499501001045
360499501001052
360499501001059
360499501001061
360499501001065
360499501001066
360499501001067
360499501001129
360499501002239
360499501002247
360499501002249
360499501002252
360499501002273
360499504002076
360499504002077
360499505001057
360499505001075
360499505001088
360499505001105

Hughes Network Systems, LLC **Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications** Hughes Network Systems, LLC Hughes Network Systems, LLC Hughes Network Systems, LLC **Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications** Hughes Network Systems, LLC **Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications** Hughes Network Systems, LLC Hughes Network Systems, LLC **Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications** 

#### Awardee

360499507002111
360499507003135
360499507003361
360499507003367
360499507004001
360499504001067
360499504001154
360110410002022
360650239021011
360775914005004
360775914005014
360191003005040

Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Frontier Communications Hughes Network Systems, LLC Hughes Network Systems, LLC New Visions Communications Newport Telephone Company Otsego Electric Cooperative Otsego Electric Cooperative Verizon Communications